Synthesis Workshop
Bengaluru, 15th October 2015
About Bengaluru Blueprint

• A multi-stakeholder collaborative visioning exercise for the city with an implementation roadmap;

• Core objective to set in motion a virtuous self-sustaining cycle of transformative change in the city; sharp focus on “How” in addition to “What”

• Recognises that major issues and solutions are well-known and a lot of work is being done by governments, citizens, academia, corporates and others; but there is a need to set well-defined goals and synthesis these disparate efforts so as to achieve these goals in defined timelines
About Bengaluru Blueprint

• Key features:
  - Quantified, quality of life goals; practical but ambitious and inspiring
  - Specific 5 year measurable goals, measurable annual milestones
  - Detailed activities and tasks leading to accomplishing milestones
  - Activities and tasks comprising both projects and institutional reforms
  - Clearly defined ownership, responsibilities; intrinsic inter-agency coordination
  - Quarterly dashboards, review meetings and status updates in simple, predefined templates
  - Proper institutional capacities to support process both from government side, and support from outside; recognition that government and other stakeholders need to work together systematically

• Key features listed above help overcome deep underlying issues that impedes efficient, sustained implementation that leads to progressively better quality of life

• Priorities for the city obtained from stakeholders in first phase; next steps include expanding stakeholder base, identifying and engaging with sectoral champions, synthesising priorities into roadmaps, engaging with government
Stakeholders Met

• One on one interviews conducted with 72 key stakeholders so far covering below categories, to obtain priorities

  • Political Leaders: Ministers, MLAs, Mayor
  • Government: Agency Heads, Principal Secretaries
  • Academia: IISc, NIAS, IIM-B, CiSTUP
  • Domain Experts
  • CSOs, Citizen Groups
  • Eminent Citizens: Artistes, Sportsmen, Writers, Business Heads
  • Corporates
  • Senior Editors

• Further engagement proposed with RWAs, citizens/community groups, online campaigns to obtain priorities
Solutions by Theme

These solutions have been synthesized from our conversations with seventy two stakeholders during September-October 2015. These and additional solutions that emerge from future conversations and workshops would feed into sectoral or thematic roadmaps. These solutions are presently in draft stage.
Themes by which solutions have been classified
Mobility

Traffic Studies and Technology

Reducing Congestion

Affecting Behavioural Change

Public Transport

Non Motorised Transport

Car Pooling

Parking

Roads
**Traffic Management and Behavioural Change**

**Traffic Studies and Technology**
- Undertake origin destination surveys and overlay existing bus routes on these to understand service gaps
- Undertake study to ascertain number of pedestrians, and share of usage of roads by each category of transportation
- Establish a Traffic Data centre for data research, dynamic management, command and control centre across civic entities (e.g. changing traffic flows, penalising violations etc.)
- Implement effective IT solutions like GPS tracking of buses/ inter-modal smart cards which can also be used for targeted subsidies etc; possibly a comprehensive digital infrastructure plan including the traffic management centre etc.
- Establish time and cost benchmarks or standards for distances within the city

**Reducing Congestion**
- Levy congestion charges in a phased manner, in CBD area
- Pilot care free zones in commercial street, brigade road etc. and enhance coverage to specific market areas in a phased manner, supported by related commensurate parking;
- Explore bidding registration numbers, permitting registration-number based usage of private vehicles
- Charge progressively higher registration charges for households with more than one car

**Affecting Behavioural Change**
- Train traffic policemen; fill vacancies in a phased manner
- Show videos on responsible driving at the RTO while procuring licenses, like in Singapore, highlighting self-benefits
- Set higher bar for obtaining licences, redo driving licence rules and plug corruption; end to end IT implementation in RTOs
- Engage driving schools to change the way driving is learnt/imparted
Mobility

Public Transport – Buses

- Expand coverage, increase investments
- Redesign bus stops to expand capacity, rationalise locations
- First right of access to public transport vehicles including autos
- **Implement BRTS on ORR, dedicated bus lanes; articulated buses**
- Incentivise usage of public transport
- Rationalisation of fares in both directions as required
- Short haul buses to connect to metro
- Spend surpluses on improving services rather than upgrading offices
- Incentivise PPPs, be transparent in contracting
- Investments needed for increasing bus fleet by 1,000 buses every year for doubling the fleet size, annual maintenance, more depots etc.
- Levy cess on diesel to fund expanded Volvo fleet
- Land allotment in outer areas for bus depots, to support and increase services to these areas
- Widen roads e.g. Tannery road, KR Puram
- Explore feasibility of electrified bus/tram ways
## Mobility

### Public Transport – Rail & Metro

**Commuter Rail**
- Implement commuter rail network
- Increase/introduce suburban/commuter rail services especially during peak hours
- Run shuttle services from railway stations to large IT parks/other places of work during peak hours
- Make LCR a statutory body.

**Metro**
- Expand coverage, hasten progress of work
- Undertake a serious review of cost benefits of the Metro, including timelines, usage, impact on citizens etc.

### Non-Motorised Transport

**Cycling**
- Replace student bus passes with subsidised cycles, encourage corporates to incentivise cycling to work

**Walking & pedestrian infrastructure**
- Create a walkable city; use pre-fabricated blocks for quick progress
- Better pedestrian crossings, both in terms of numbers and quality
- Explore 70:30 mix in pedestrian oriented design; i.e. design for pedestrians rather than for traffic
- Explore skywalks with escalator which could be run through solar energy
- Follow the model of Gangtok where foot paths are railed to ensure that vehicles do not ply or get parked on foot path. This initiative could be piloted from Infantry Road
## Mobility

### Car Pooling
- End monopoly of BMTC, permit shuttles/minivans/Zip Go-type models/car-pooling services
- Subsidise city cab/pooling services, massively multiply their numbers from the existing 60,000 to say 300,000. Recognise autos/cab services as part of public transport
- Co-opt companies to incentivise employees based on usage of car-pooling services, make parking very expensive/difficult, and incentivise corporates to expand bus services and stagger work hours to reduce peak hour congestion
- Incentivise Work From Home where feasible, incentivise corporates based on number of employees on WFH

### Parking
- Robust policy needed; mandate stilt/underground parking in all new constructions at the building plan approval phase, both commercial and residential
- Link registration of vehicle to evidence of parking space availability, in each case
- Incentivise PPPs for parking through tax breaks, multi-layered parking lots
- Actively explore and maximise parking at bus and metro stations
- Levy significantly higher parking charges especially in centres of high consumption e.g. 100 ft road
- Incentivise hotels to manage their own traffic
- Create a database of road measurements and parking spaces
## Mobility

### Roads

- **Scale Tender SURE**
- Clean up ORR and arterial roads with practical surface design interventions. Use target average travel time as a goal, say 80 km/h for ORR
- Identify and explore solutions to fix missing road links within the city
- Restrict number of flyovers, use strategically in ring roads/arterial roads; accelerate peripheral ring road
- **Set and implement standards for asphalting and maintenance, supported by 3-5 year maintenance contracts**
- Remove toll plazas, use technology/sensors to charge tolls
- **Use GPS, map underground utilities like water and sanitation lines for sustainable road improvement**
- Develop an Alternate road to airport
- Explore Gujarat’s land pooling model for land acquisition (needed for road widening, and fixing the missing links in city roads)
- Transparency in contracting and cost estimation
- Execution of Signal Free Corridor project in Whitefield
- Attention should be paid to design in building of road infrastructure, which is more crucial than construction of the road
Water Supply & Sanitation

Institutional

Pricing & Measurement

Treatment, Recycling & Usage

Distribution & Leakage

Lakes, Tanks & Groundwater

Rain Water Harvesting & other Conservation

Storm Water Drains

Sewerage & Sanitation
## Water Supply & Sanitation

### Institutional

- Convert BWSSB into a company as in the case of BESCOM for better management and efficiency; empower and fix full accountability
- Recognise that there is an availability/quantity problem AND a distribution problem. For the availability problem, put in place a medium and long-term plan to both pump more water for Bangalore, and supplement through other sources
- Restore Thippagondanahalli dam
- Ground water recharge, Lakes Storm Water Drains, Rain Water Harvesting, Recycling and Sewage treatment are all parts of the solution
- Integrated Water Plan for the city under the aegis of the BWSSB, but integrating related plans and operations of BBMP, LDA, CGWB, BDA etc.
## Water Supply & Sanitation

### Pricing and Measurement
- Price water appropriately and do away with water subsidies/raise tariff especially at the higher end of the socio-economic spectrum; raise resources for the large capital investments required to expand water supply network
- Government could give away a certain quantity of water free to the poor and above that charge them nominally
- Sewage disposal to be made a paid service, the price of which should be added to the water bills
- Abolish the sewage cess and increase the price of water
- Measure storage and usage of water to devise sustainable solutions (as in Singapore)

### Treatment, Recycling & Usage
- Do not process all water to potable level. Instead have the water treated to usable levels and specify it as non-potable while making alternate arrangements for potable water; explore separate pipelines for potable and non-potable water.
- Incentivize reuse and recycling of water by giving incentives for related equipment (VAT concessions, 100% depreciation for IT purposes etc.)
- Mandate and implement separate pipelines in residences for use of recycled water in toilets, gardens etc.
- Promote use of recycled water and help people overcome the psychological barriers of using it
- Employ demonstration effect to help eliminate the mental block in using recycled water. For eg, Singapore leaders drank recycled water in public to generate awareness on usage of recycled water
## Distribution & Leakage

- Put in place plan to replace old pipes with stainless steel pipes over a period of ten years
- Use non-intrusive technologies like sleeves to identify water leakage
- Scale E-Kaveri initiative; significantly reduce Unaccounted For Water (UfW)
- Use GIS technology to identify and map the entire water and sewerage network, including storm water drains
- Move away from pumping bulk water from Cauvery; explore Singapore type model

## Lakes, Tanks & Groundwater

- Conserve and rehabilitate existing water bodies / lakes
- Ground Level reservoirs(GLRs) and tanks have to repaired and restored
- Encourage use of lake water as when water gets used, the lake also gets rejuvenated.
- **Measure groundwater levels in different neighbourhoods across the city**
- Regulate uncontrolled construction activity around aquifer recharge zones, lakes
- **Constitute Lake Protection Committees as directed by Karnataka High Court**
- Map existing lakes to chart out protective steps to prevent further loss
- Rejuvenate lakes by dividing the lake between companies and community groups to take up the process of rejuvenation. It should not be titular ownership, but enabling communities to take charge of the restoration and maintenance on an ongoing basis
- Lake Conservancy group can be formed with statutory powers. It should be able to collect fees, fines if people litter in or around lakes. It should be independent of Government. Government need not fund the same. Private parties can fund and maintain the same. The reason for this suggestion is that the procedures and specifications of Government are not at par with quality
## Water Supply & Sanitation

### Rain Water Harvesting & Other Conservation

- Rainwater harvesting has to be mandated & promoted for groundwater recharging. Common rainwater harvesting challenges such as quality concerns need to be addressed by appropriate research institutions/experts.
- Infrastructure for this should be built during the construction phase. There should be strict monitoring through coordination between city agencies to ensure compliance and heavy penalties should be levied for flouting this rule.
- **Need to measure ground-water level; need for regular monitoring mechanisms**
- Create awareness about water conservation and promote use of water saving equipment.
- In order to prevent rainwater mixing with sewage, mandate that water and sewage pipes be marked separately in all building plans.
- Link rain water harvesting/sewage treatment plants with grant of housing loans by banks and financial institutions.

### Storm Water Drains

- Improve drainage systems of the city to curb water logging and rain-related traffic problems.
- Significant expertise/talent needed to fix sewerage/storm water drains.
- Place ‘trash racks’ in Storm Water Drains to prevent drowning and to recover solid waste.
## Water Supply & Sanitation

### Sewerage & Sanitation

- Large investments required for laying adequate sewerage network both for the present and future
- Invest in more Sewage Treatment plants (STP); improve existing STP’s waste-water recycling capacity and usage
- Decentralise sewage treatment at the ward level.
- Incentivise/mandate use of tertiary treated water for non-potable purpose
- Mandate STPs in apartment complexes, other large establishments. Prior to giving water connection, have the same inspected by BWSSB. Sanction of building plans and issuance of OC should be linked to functioning STPs.
- Explore solutions such as the DEWATS technique formulated by the BORDA network
- Explore and implement use of natural, plant-based techniques of sewerage treatment to the extent possible
- Explore metering of sewerage for bulk generators (like in Australia) to track the presence and extent of treatment, pricing, costing etc.
- Popularise public toilets designed by DRDO
- Consider appropriate pricing for sewerage to ensure availability of funds for proper network
- Review and amend engineering of Storm Water Drains vis-à-vis sewerage lines underlying them, especially in areas with dense slums or slum-like settlements, in order to systemically prevent both bursting of sewerage pipes and lack of sewerage connections
Solid Waste Management

Institutional ........................................................................................................... 20
Collection & Segregation ......................................................................................... 21
Disposal ................................................................................................................... 22
Solid Waste Management

Institutional

- Actively explore methods to raise consciousness on the drawbacks of a culture of consumption
- Involve private sector / individuals to provide technical support on solid waste management; bolster skills and capacities of managerial staff handling solid waste management, including disposal
- Decentralise the system of waste management with total community participation
- Better monitoring of contractors in respect of labour and equipment deployed in wards
- Provide incentives for hotels to take up waste management in their locality
- Large apartments should mandatorily manage their waste internally
- To deal with E-waste a national policy is to be framed to identify locations for deep burial
- Identify city’s bulk generators of SWM such as industries/ commercial entities etc. and strictly enforce a zero-waste policy for them that may be incentivised
Solid Waste Management

Collection & Segregation

- Mandate segregation at source, at household level and decentralise recycling of dry waste
- Wet waste should be composted at every ward individually, and dry and hazardous waste should be collected separately by autos/tippers for recycling; move towards zero waste strategies
- Systematic engagement of RWAs, communities and citizens to achieve higher % of segregation
- Introduce public bins segregated for dry and wet waste in all areas of Bangalore especially at food courts/ darshinis
- Each ward must have its separate waste segregation unit
- Have more garbage segregation drives in the city
- Scientific Infrastructure for segregated waste management should mandated
- Focus to be changed to mixed waste handling
- **Levy charges for collection of garbage**
- Use technology and automated methods for street sweeping
- Mandate usage of only tipper autos for door to door garbage collection, eliminate push carts
- **Pournakarmikas should be empowered to monetise the dry waste collected; thus incentivise segregated collection**
Solid Waste Management

Disposal

• Establish a well-functioning system of supply chain to transform waste to energy; set up decentralised waste to energy plants
• Re-process and re-use construction waste (example of China's National Highway with re-processed construction waste without compromising on quality standards)
City Planning

Institutional Process........................................................................................................24
Planning Principles ........................................................................................................25
Role of BDA ....................................................................................................................26
Project Execution ............................................................................................................26
Balanced Urbanisation .....................................................................................................27
Zoning & Building Plan ...................................................................................................27
Others .............................................................................................................................27
City Planning

Institutional Process

• Adopt the Bangalore Master Plan and mandate that all agencies follow the Master Plan
• Common base map of Bangalore that is in the custody of a single authority and used across agencies
• Create a unified planning authority with representatives from the BBMP, BDA, and UDD. BMRCL, BMTC etc. along with two subject-matter experts from every field to coordinate and plan city’s development; include inputs from access planners, demographers, sociologists, financial analysts, health professionals etc.
• Have experienced, certified urban planners rather than bureaucrats lead urban planning institutions/departments
• Create a committee of experts to guide the formation of the master plan for the city after which it should be put up for debate and opinions from stakeholder groups
• Open the process for development of Master Plan, engage citizens; provide full disclosure and updates on status and progress
City Planning

**Principles**

- All projects before implementation must be checked for (i) sustainability and (ii) affordability
- **City planning should have a component that looks at the upliftment of underprivileged sections of society to curb inequality and related problems of crime and safety**
- Adequate access to water supply and sanitation should be an important consideration while determining city plan
- Urban planning needs to be carried out with sensitivity to environment and resource constraint
- Think of work and living spaces together while planning
- Factor in the multiplier effect of a new employee in Bangalore bringing his/her family into the city while planning for the future
- Effectively regulate real estate and housing, and the way the city is planned and developed
- The city plan should suit Bangalore and factor in its mixed growth pattern, and not be necessarily based or derived from western models
- Ward level plans need to be made with citizen participation; ward-level assessment of infra needs to be an input into the ward and city plans
- Create Station Area Plans i.e. Identify special areas/zones such that planning around these areas results in focused density development, safe and conducive environment for pedestrians, promotes heritage and culture etc. (For example: metro station areas planned by Embarq)
## Role of BDA

- BDA should completely move away from constructing layouts and selling plots, building shopping complexes, and should focus on operating as a Planning and Standard-setting body.
- BDA should take on the role of a regulator and lay down/monitor basic quality of life/civic services parameters and standards that have to be met in the development of new plots or projects, e.g. check the legal ownership to the land being constructed, mandate and monitor the certain basic amenities every layout should have etc.

## Project Execution

- Quantify impact of all development projects using globally accepted benchmarks and measurement standards so that co-benefits can be measured
- Encourage PPPs/private sector participation in creation of infrastructure, both at city and ward levels; create frameworks/standards for PPPs to operationalise them.
- Carry out robust cost-benefit analyses of costs for large projects and increase their transparency
- Operationalise TDRs
- Use better technology for construction; lease construction equipment instead of buying them
- Eliminate contract risk, especially in property ownership; issue GO to the effect that approval by one government dept/authority/agency tantamounts to approval by the state government
- Eliminate role and influence of corporates in planning committees as today private interests are overriding public interest
# City Planning

## Balanced Urbanisation

- Carefully understand history of the city, and how it has influenced the present context as a key basis of planning for Bangalore.
- Consider urbanisation and growth of Bangalore in the context of Mysore and Tumkur; direct growth, investments and connectivity accordingly.
- Significantly enhance connectivity with rural habitations so people can commute to city but stay outside city limits, like in Tamil Nadu. This would reduce travel distance from home to work. Supplement this with city services that factor in work locations of migrants.

## Zoning & Building Plan

- Create adequate number of self-sufficient nodes or meta-neighbourhoods in the city, so access to basic services and quality of life does not require frequent/extensive travel within city.
- **Strengthen zoning regulations, and enforce full implementation of the same**
- Clearly zone residential and commercial areas.
- Undertake systematic study of terrain before granting building approvals, taking up new developments.

## Others

- Direct urban infrastructure like malls along NICE road.
- Use forest areas outside Bangalore to build a large park like Lalbagh/Cubbon Park or a forest reserve open to public.
- Display model of the city at a central location and keep it updated for changes, so people are able to see a 3D model of the city.
- Train staff in futuristic planning of public services.
- Increase FSI in core areas around the Metro and Outer Ring Road/ arterial stretches to deter urban sprawl.
- Reassess growth plans along ORR in Whitefield area.
Environment

Institutional---------------------------------------------------------------29
Air Pollution---------------------------------------------------------------29
Reduction of Pollutants-----------------------------------------------------30
Greenery-------------------------------------------------------------------30
### Environment

**Institutional**

- Recognise pollution as a civic, city-level issue rather than central/state subject; create an enabling policy environment
- Set realistic benchmarks or goals to move towards e.g. set 1990 levels pollution as the target level and move towards it
- Take up projects that address climate change objectives; access funds from international organisations like World Bank, ADB etc.
- Actively work with businesses to make them sensitive to environment

**Air Pollution**

- **Incentivise electric vehicles to reduce emission**
- Mandate better air quality monitoring mechanisms, publish data widely and raise awareness on health implications of data points; consider large electronic displays across the city with related health indicators
- Raise greater awareness about health effects of pollution given lack of visible effects
- Phase out 2 stroke engines
- Enforce standard emission levels of buses/ trucks/ autos etc.
- Manage dust and pollution created from new road construction and resurfacing projects
- Catalyse widespread use of air sensors to generate large quantities of credible hyper local data on air pollution
Environment

Reduce Pollutants

- **Strict enforcement against unlawful discharge of effluents by industrial units**
- Complete ban on Plastics below 40 microns
- Promote plastic-free days, beginning with once a week
- **Hold anti-honking/ noise pollution awareness campaigns; engage driving schools to change behaviour**
- Consider differential tax rates for motor vehicles based on fuel efficiency slabs
- All shops should charge for plastic covers as it is proven that pricing covers reduce its consumption by half.

Greenery

- **Achieve acceptable benchmarks for open spaces and parks in the city**
- Instead of one green belt around the city, break it up and mandate green belts or green areas in each locality
- **Insist on adequate open spaces and parks in all new developments**
- Encourage urban gardening and create incentives/ mechanisms to facilitate the same
- Map all pockets of forest land in Bangalore, create inventory of different plant/ animal species, publish details and take active steps to preserve biodiversity and greenery. These could also be opened to public with appropriate safeguards
- All round-abouts in the city to be adopted by corporates/institutions and greenery to be enhanced
- **Associations and individuals should be allowed to adopt lakes and parks**
- Encourage corporates to promote organic farming and urban gardening on campus as an alternate to manicured lawns and the like
- Create a network of urban forests
Health

Prevention

Institutional

Health Infrastructure
## Health

### Prevention

- Create a database of health profile of Bangaloreans through the UID system with a strict privacy policy, so Non Communicable Diseases can be detected and prevented (e.g. by capturing information on blood sugar levels, lipid profiles etc.)
- Create donor database for bone marrow transplant; run a campaign to collect sputum samples to facilitate the same
- Create policy framework for organ donation
- Provide health screening on OPD basis to public transport drivers; provide health allowance.
- Fast-track conversion of public transport vehicles, including autos and cabs, to CNG to address rampant respiratory issues among Bangaloreans
- Allow NABH accredited labs to carry out dengue tests
- Undertake serious efforts to eradicate disease-bearing mosquitoes; explore the services of Vector Control Research Centre, Pondicherry; acknowledge serious health implications of mosquitoes, the widespread incidence of Dengue/vector borne diseases
- Put out data on rabies in public domain; acknowledge stray dogs as being part of the public health challenge and explore and implement a middle ground solution between dog welfare and public health (e.g. explore a shelter for stray dogs which can in due course become a fun place for dog lovers)
## Institutional

- Develop Bangalore as an international healthcare destination; should be preceded by creating infrastructure for leisure tourism
- Simplify cumbersome procedures in recruitment of health professionals in public hospitals
- Recognise colleges offering CPS Diploma courses (precedence in Maharashtra)
- Address undersupply of medical professionals, steadily declining numbers of nursing care professionals; actively incentivise private sector medical professionals to devote time in government hospitals
- **Move Health out of BBMP’s remit into State Govt. except for aspects such as fumigation etc. which should remain with the BBMP**
- Systematically and regularly publish health data and diseases data. Currently there is a possible underestimation of disease incidences. Put in place a Health Information network to obtain and publish credible data.
- Government should also create and publish database of all hospitals and clinics in the city, and various government schemes and facilities that can be availed in government hospitals
- Catalyse more PPPs in Health sector
- Govt. hospitals need to be referral hospitals
- Govt hospitals need to undertake initiatives such as blood donation camps to build trust with communities
## Health Infrastructure

- Establish requisite number of PHUs and PHCs in Bangalore commensurate with population, and ensure appropriate demographic/geographic spread
- Allow AYUSH doctors to run PHCs/PHUs. (There is already precedence from Maharashtra and Tamil Nadu)
- PHCs need better monitoring and government requires greater capacities for the same
- Healthcare and health awareness needs to be made more easily available to the poor; including targeted awareness at ward level (e.g. organising health clinics every Wednesday by the BBMP at an AC level)
Education

Institutional .................................................................................. 36
Higher Education ........................................................................... 36
Quality of Schools ........................................................................... 37
### Education

#### Institutional

- Existing government schools to be strengthened; address manpower and skills shortage through committed voluntarism/citizen participation, CSR, NGO engagement
- **BBMP should hand over its schools to the State Government**
- Strictly enforce RTE norms in private schools
- **Mandate systematic training of teachers in government schools, ensure skill upgradation is continuous**
- Entrust an institution with the task of developing innovative ways of teaching e.g. to teach binomial theorem, how to use technology in teaching etc.
- Encourage inclusion of children from all economic strata in the same class room

#### Higher Education

- Establish more research oriented universities
- Create diversity in educational institutions by de-regulating higher education similar to the steps initiated in the 1980s in the context of engineering colleges in Karnataka
- **Create a vibrant connect between education and employment sector along the model of Singapore**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Quality of Schools</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Crackdown on authorities that charge exorbitant amounts for rent of school building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improve quality of government schools by focussing on infrastructure, teachers’ training; motivate teachers through incentives and disincentives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Engage with corporates and philanthropists to fill certain gaps in infrastructure and facilities in government schools such as vans, uniforms, Computer, Lab, tables, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Identify low quality public schools whose image is severely tarnished; introduce reforms through PPP models or mission mode approach</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Provide adequate toilet facilities in government schools, especially for girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Anganwadi programme to be encouraged and strengthened</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Include and emphasise on value education (including emphasis on aspects such as respect for humanity and animals, non-materialism etc.) and extracurricular activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Institute Schools to Job programs, to link school education with jobs</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Crime & Safety

Enhancing Safety____________________________________________________39
Crime Prevention____________________________________________________40
Fire Safety_________________________________________________________41
Crime & Safety

Enhancing Safety

• Develop an integrated and comprehensive City Safety charter
• Set ambitious goal of making Bangalore safest city for women in five years; safety not through confinement but through true freedom
• Lay emphasis on value education and culture
• **Focus on women as key target stakeholders in safety; place that at the heart of city planning. Focus on different aspects such as street lighting etc., promote mental and physical wellness for better productivity, and emphasize on making the city a space where women can realise their true potential**
• Measure safety not just through crime rates, but also through qualitative measures
• Bangalore needs a street Lighting Authority run by private players to ensure Operations and Maintenance of street lights. This has significant importance to safety. Refer to the model of Ahmedabad and Surat in this context.
## Crime Prevention

- Significantly enhance punishment for crimes and violations
- **Fill police vacancies in a time-bound manner, increase the number of police personnel commensurate with population and accepted benchmarks in policing**
- Should involve citizens actively - Incentivise/disincentives safe behaviour
- Explore surprise checks mixed with visible policing accompanied with public naming e.g. publishing names of violators and criminals in newspapers
- Enhance coverage of CCTVs; cover both highly crowded and highly secluded areas; enlist support of corporate sponsorships for procurement
- **Include Community Policing as a necessary element of city policing; create policy backing through amendment to Karnataka Police Act; run community leadership programs**
- Identify and address specific root causes of crimes in lower income groups
- Run vocational training in crime prone, lower income neighbourhoods and communities
Fire Safety

- Increase number of fire stations commensurate with population in the city
- Governments to engage with private players and use PPP models to get adequate funding to put in place equipment and safeguards to increase fire safety in the city
- Map buildings, high rises, road width etc. digitally; so that if an emergency occurs the responding agencies can be better prepared with the specific equipment that would be required in that building
- Systematically engage citizens so as to create an enlightened group of citizens who can understand and engage on fire safety issues
- Strengthen policies on building safety
- **Retrofit laws for installing fire safety equipment in older buildings**
- Empanel external agency to inspect buildings for various safety measures pertaining to fire and issue a certificate of competency thereafter
- Integrated emergency response between fire, police and other emergency services; and create better synergy between parastatals
- **Make Fire safety education compulsory part of school and college curriculum, with regular fire drills; make such classes be interactive and engaging**
Human Rights & Equality

Protection

Shelter

Equality & Inclusion
## Human Rights & Equality

### Protection

- Eradicate manual scavenging of sewers
- Mandate social security measure for labourers, particularly women

### Shelter

- Government needs to provide more shelter homes with better quality and an open system; psychological trauma and delinquency need to be addressed more sensitively
- Bring fresh thinking and perspective to these homes, hire new additional resources for the same
- Partner with NGOs to overcome capacity constraints
Equality & Inclusion

• Institute policies to include transgenders in mainstream economy and society
• Encourage RWAs to widen mandate and evolve as groups without sharp social or economic divides; forge a sense of community in neighbourhoods
• Understand and invest in basic infrastructure for migrants such as hostels, cooking facilities
• Catalyse informal engagement programs around construction sites, provide gender and language education etc. to migrants; leverage mobile network, create database by working with contracting agencies, real estate developers etc.
• Government should keep track of rural population coming to the city for work
• Explore having a migrant liaison officer in Police stations
• Lean on regional cultural associations to mobilise migrants and communicate with them
• Effectively leverage the Building and other Construction Workers' Welfare Fund and utilise this appropriately for the welfare of construction labourers
• Policy mandate should be that builders should not just donate 1% to the Welfare Fund, but also follow-up on implementation of welfare schemes for migrants, at least under CSR.
• Identify and engage Bangalore-based organisations that have evolved scalable solutions in immunisation, housing, education etc. and apply the same for the benefit of Bangalore
Culture & Heritage

Identity .......................................................... 46
Culture ........................................................... 46
Heritage Conservation .......................................... 47
Open Spaces ....................................................... 48
## Culture & Heritage

### Identity

- Discover and propagate a common identity that binds Bangaloreans; promote the same in public consciousness to forge a sense of community
- Encourage Bangaloreans to demonstrate good citizenship through volunteerism, responsible citizenship campaigns etc.
- Propagate certain specific identities/culture through diktat by employing a set of rules/laws for citizens to abide by. E.g. Singapore has strict penalties for littering streets, chewing gum etc.
- State should mandate basic introductory sessions in Kannada for all migrant population
- Promote values in such a way that fighting corruption becomes new identity of Bangalore and a way of life for its citizens. Corruption is not always monetary in nature. Its root cause is not money but destruction of values.

### Culture

- **Revive the Urban Arts Commission; empower it**
- Consolidate government-run cultural institutions and centres under a common umbrella/department/entity
- **Revive Bengaluru Habba or create an alternative; make public spaces come alive**
- Engage with Defence authorities and PSUs with large land banks to leverage their land for such shared public events
- Leverage festivals as occasions or opportunities to promote sense of community and shared identity
- Promote use of Kannada; actively consider running Kannada classes for migrants
- Constitute an Aesthetic detail commission to lay down design standards for neighbourhoods
- Establish a good public library that citizens can be proud of
- Establish cultural centres like Ranga Shankara in other parts of the city, at least another 5 such centres that are suitably spread geographically
- Evolve a thoughtful, critical public culture in the city
### Heritage

- Rejuvenate iconic structures associated with Bangalore’s identity
- Preserve existing structures (E.g. Lal Bagh etc.) by involving private players in their management, and for improving infrastructure (Ensuring restroom, food & beverages at heritage sites etc.)
- Revisit entry fees as appropriate
- **Draft a heritage law for Bangalore to preserve heritage assets and promote city heritage**
- Establish more Museums of art and culture
- Actively support, through suitable policies, annual fests, dances, arts, crafts, food fests, etc.; use heritage centres for music concerts, dance shows etc.
- Position Bangalore as the cultural hub and cultivate strong bonds with other parts of the state through promotion of common culture and values (promotion arts & crafts in Bangalore from all over the State such as performing arts, handicrafts crafts, etc.)
- Promote/incentivise local artisans and provide livelihood in their traditional knowledge
- **Map buildings of heritage value and raise public consciousness and awareness of the same**
- Designate 'Swarna Valaya', a heritage zone comprising series of heritage buildings (project proposed by Mr. Narasimhan to the GoK) and shift it to a public trust to facilitate preservation and promotion
**Culture & Heritage**

**Open Spaces**

- Actively explore developing lake fronts as shared spaces for citizens, through responsible commercial use and robust monitoring against encroachment/commercialisation.
- **Negotiate for excess land held with the Cantonment to be converted into public spaces along the Singapore model.**
- Explore better utilisation of open land in palace grounds through active intervention of state government.
Housing & Real Estate

Institutional Process .......................................................... 50
Affordability ........................................................................... 50
Availability & Planning ............................................................ 51
Institutional Process

- Pilot land titling for urban land in Bangalore
- Create a unique code for each building, link these codes to Stamps and Registration department, BESCOM etc., thus creating a unique ID for each building which can be used across agencies, and across tax and other purposes
- Fight corruption in processes such as property registration on a war footing
- Govt. regulations on set-backs need to be sensible, and depending on location within city (e.g. London)

Affordability

- Provide hostel accommodation on rental basis for migrants and workers in industrial units
- Build rest houses for drivers and other service staff at tourist spots for relaxation and rejuvenation
- Slum Clearance Board needs a time-frame to declare areas as slums and issue clearances; Government needs to have enforceable, time-bound policies on this front.
- Make a % provision in each new, large housing project for low cost housing
- Enhance government’s role in affordable housing projects
- Seriously study and address housing for the poor and access to livelihoods as joint issues, incorporate the same as a central element of city planning
- Constructively engage real estate developers in affordable housing
- With Govt. support on land, construction industry can collaborate to offer comfortable and decent housing for EWS section
- Adoption of Pre fabricated modular housing can help create more affordable housing
Housing & Real Estate

 Availability & Planning

- Tap value in defence, railways, HAL, HMT, Land
- Direct housing development in consonance with proposed metro lines
- BDA should firmly move away from selling plots; BDA should do basic development of land/layouts and then engage private sector to develop the layout
- BDA can however explore building apartments to fill the affordable housing gap
- Ensure real estate development and housing is factored in the city plan based on other factors such as mobility and water
## Animal Welfare

### Institutional Process

- **Create more shelters for animals with good sanitary facilities and humane conditions**
- **Adopt birth control strategies for stray dogs etc. that are compassionate and non-destructive**
- **Create a monitoring mechanism with powers to keep a strict check on treatment and care of animals within the city and its shelters**
- **Hold awareness campaigns on the need for animal welfare and environment protection for better quality of life**
### Power Generation

- Explore dedicated power generation for Bangalore, through both solar and otherwise
- Explore if additional power can be purchased for Bangalore
- **Incentivise solar power through tax breaks, reduced power bills etc.; link solar power to grid**
- **Use open storm water drains for placing solar panels**
- Have hybrid solar panels with wind power capacity (for night time use); mandate use by all government buildings, education institutions to leverage large surface areas
- In new gated communities, link solar power generation to building plan sanction
- Promote gas based power plants

### Power Distribution & Usage

- Encourage and incentivise power saving and disincentivise excess power usage
  - Time Of Day metering and higher tariffs for peak hour consumption
  - Provide incentives to households for use of LED bulbs
- Expand coverage of 'Distribution Automation System' (DAS) to overcome power interruptions due to distribution/maintenance issues
- Strict review and regulation of transmission and distribution losses including through
  - Use of IT mechanisms, automation and
  - Strict punishment for vandalism, engaging chowkidars at night
Poverty

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Give the Poor a Voice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Recognise demands not just of the elite; make serious efforts to understand challenges of the poor and other underprivileged communities and factor the same into policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Establish an intellectual link with the poor, engage them actively in public discourse</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Trade & Investment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Improving the Economy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Establish an Economic Development Authority as recommended in the BBMP restructuring Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• View growth in trade and investments in light of changes in quality of city’s infrastructure and services; aspects like safety, affordable housing, land management etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Engineer balanced growth, especially between North and South Bangalore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Focus on growth and development of local trade and business; leave foreign investment to state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Specifically focus on corruption impacting small businesses and industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Set up an efficient employment exchange</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Governance

Mayor______________________________57
Council______________________________57
Inter-Agency Coordination________________58
Governance Structure____________________59
**Governance**

### Mayor

- Create a Mayor In Council system, with the Commissioner reporting to the Mayor In Council
- **Increase term of the Mayor to at least 2.5 years, preferably 5 years vs Directly elected Mayor with a 5 year term**
- Systematically learn from the experience of cities in similar societies/economies with directly elected mayors
- Continue structured, systematic conversations on roadmap to directly elected mayoral system

### Council

- Co-opt Councillors as part of civil society discourse on development and governance; minimise divisive discourse on socioeconomic lines
- Create circumstances for active citizens to contest council elections without need for nomination
- Encourage councillors to constitute advisory groups for themselves/ward
- Incentivise good performance giving away awards of Best Ward, Councillor, Best Council Debate etc.
- Mandate attendance of MLAs in Council to improve the quality for debates; set minimum attendance for MPs
- Engage constructively with academia; utilise intellectual capital available in the city
## Inter-Agency Coordination

- **Strengthen the coordination committee that presently meets once a fortnight; make its role more strategic**
- Project integration by all agencies in the city at each level of service delivery across wards. E.g., all junior engineers in different wards from BBMP, BDA and BWSSB to be in sync regarding any project that is being taken up in the city.
- Explore rotation in staffing/secondment of staff between BBMP, BWSSB, BDA and BMTC to forge team spirit and mutual understanding; introduce bridge courses to fill any skill gaps.
- Document and publish roles and responsibilities of each civic agency from a citizen’s perspective.
- Establish a mechanism to capture for each major decision of a civic agency, negative effects on operations of other civic agencies and net cost or benefit of the decision.
## Governance

### Governance Structure

1. **BBMP Restructuring Committee Model**
   - GBA chaired by CM and with all civic agencies reporting into it
   - 5 MCs with directly elected Mayors VS MCs without disturbing core Bangalore
   - Empowered Zonal and Ward Committees

2. **Minister for Bangalore supported by ACS level officer to whom all agency heads report**

3. **Strengthen BBMP Council and Administration**
   - An ACS/PS level officer heads BBMP
   - Have all project proposals in the city greater than a certain predefined value placed before the BBMP Council for inputs and comments, irrespective of which agency is executing the same
   - Agency heads do not report to BBMP Commissioner, but are junior in hierarchy
   - Roadmap for agency heads to report into BBMP Commissioner in due course; but retain corporate identity of parastatals

4. **Make Zonal Committee an immediate priority, is an easily achievable goal**

5. **Emulating Borough system of London**
   - Make each assembly constituency as a borough.
   - Make MLA its chairperson.
   - 50% of the revenue collected should be spent in the same borough.
   - Each of these boroughs can be further divided into wards.
   - Fix the number of RWAs on the basis of boundaries fixed by sense of neighbourhood and not mere geographies to avoid conflicts.
   - Facilitate citizen participation and engagement through these platforms
Citizen Participation

Ward Committee & Platforms ................................. 61
RWAs ............................................................. 61
Others ............................................................. 62
## Citizen Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ward Committees &amp; Similar Platforms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Undertake deeper decentralisation; increase mobilisation, devolve power and finance to local levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Internalise collaborative governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ward committees to be formed and be headed by councillors vs Jana Spandanas with Ward Councillors and MLAs, coordinated by the Ward Engineer and supported by radical transparency in works and funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Publish quarterly/annual reports at Ward level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Create functional forums to express individual views about future/upcoming projects (like skywalks, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Establish formal mechanisms for the government to listen to public complaints/feedback. Institutionalise Grievance redressal for specific areas; CSOs and government itself should ensure subject-specific feedback reaching the right people. Online platforms such as ICMYC should be set up by govt. itself</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RWAs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• RWAs an effective supplement to Ward Committees even as the latter gains traction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Actively encourage creation of and mobilisation through RWAs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• RWAs should be given power to approve or disprove projects in its area. And follow through on monitoring of implementation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Citizen Participation

- Participatory Budgeting to be institutionalised in city agencies; citizen engagement in work monitoring and quality feedback to be catalysed; engage experts in participatory budgeting processes to gain inputs on high RoI projects and spends
- Need for all stakeholders to develop sense of civic responsibility and be part of interventions at the ward level
- Explore engagement of paid support staff at a ward level for Councillors and MLAs to assist in program implementation and monitoring
- Engage with citizens to enhance civic responsibility and collective civic ownership
- Actively solicit ideas from citizens through innovative methods like Swiss Challenge for project ideas
- Link voter ID with Aadhar card and pay Rs.1000/- as a legal incentive to encourage voting.
- Local community should have statutory authority. They should be empowered to tax or levy fine. If funds from BBMP are clearly not working then private funds should be allowed to be leveraged. Privatization in this sense would be efficient in fund utilization and maintenance of various utilities
- Corporates can be given responsibility with authority to deal with some civic infrastructure to leverage their inherent culture and expertise. Eg: TCS which manages the passport office. Organisations like Shobha Ltd and OCRA can team up to maintain the ORR. Such an arrangement should include authority to penalize people who are flouting rules
Financial Management

Tax Collection_________________________________________________________64
State Government Funds______________________________________________64
Government Assets____________________________________________________65
Others______________________________________________________________65
## Tax Collection

- Assess all properties in the city and bring them into the tax net; involve councillors in the drive
- Ensure rates are appropriately applied for commercial and residential buildings; increase collection levels
- Have a phased payment scheme for property tax e.g. 25% every quarter
- Increase penalties for property tax default
- Apply rules similar to Income Tax Act for delays, interest, fines and penalties, escalation etc.
- Advertisement tax potential should be harnessed; Illegal hoardings should be curbed
- Review tax policies of the BBMP in light of the economic growth of Bangalore, the resultant prosperity among certain sections and the pressure such growth and prosperity has exerted on infrastructure and public service delivery
- Engage councillors in tax collection and give back a portion of tax collected to the ward

## State Government Funds

- State grants should be increased by revisiting the SFC formula
- Part of state grants could be conditional subject to achievement of performance measures such as improvement in financial management, achievement of service levels, transparency, successful completion of audits etc.; the same could be formalised through an MoU with state
# Financial Management

## Government Assets

- Map BBMP’s properties through GIS and create a proper inventory of ownership and lease documents; value them as per market values and create a phased plan to realise market value over a five year period
- Actively explore PPP model to exploit revenue potential of BBMP properties, both leased and put to own use
- Use government properties like school grounds to earn revenue when not in use (e.g. weekends, evenings etc.)
- Gain assurance on assets like advertisements/hoardings which are presently hugely under estimated in numbers
- Explore mechanisms to value the revenue potential of lakes and parks, subject to environment considerations
- Levy Service charge on Central and State government properties (based on the SC ruling in the Rajkot MC case)

## Others

- Make the Karnataka Municipalities Accounting and Budgeting Rules (KMABR) 2006 applicable to the BBMP, just like it is applicable to all other Karnataka ULBs; enforce fiscal responsibility and budget management at the civic agency level
- Create financing arrangements between BBMP and State such that emergency and essential works like pothole filling etc. are not delayed due to poor financial condition of the BBMP
- Consider establishing a City Budget Office that serves as a central budget management office across all city-focussed agencies and departments
Human Resources & Organisation

Skill Building______________________________________________________67
Performance & Accountability________________________________________68
Engagement with Private Sector______________________________________68
Policy & Institutional Process________________________________________69
Workflows & Processes_____________________________________________70
Human Resources & Organisation

Skill Building

- Urgent infusion of external coaching required on the engineering and technical side to prevent bad infrastructure from continuing to come up
- Institutionalise the above with formal and mandatory skill-based certification program that covers all city staff; link the same to promotions and increments e.g. Master of City Administration, Diploma in City Administration, regular training with credits on project management, smart governance etc
- Make such certification transferable across city agencies and cities; make a definitive move away from generic capacity building or training sessions that don’t have defined learning outcomes, evaluations etc.
- Have specific allocation of each civic agency’s budget, say 2% for such skill building certification courses
- PG courses in urban planning, design, architecture and other disciplines relevant to city planning and administration to reflect real problems faced by citizens; a 3-6 month project on solving a real problem at the ward level where students apply their technical skills and gain exposure to real life situations and city engineers get exposed to modern practices
- Establish a City Management Institute as a centre of skill building and excellence in city management, both technical and general; it could be established by the government but run by a highly competent academic or research institution or an independent trust
- Upgrade courses at Administrative Training Institutes, make them contemporary and relevant
- Embed knowledge in government organisations, address “brain drain” that happens when consultants/independent contractors exit
- Draw up training plan for Councillors; consider establishing a “think tank” or a Congressional Research Service type research centre to support the Council
## Human Resources & Organisation

### Performance & Accountability
- Revise payscales of city staff to reflect current realities
- Ensure clear lines of reporting, eliminate diffused reporting
- Install CCTV cameras in government offices
- Create system of accountability for performance to Lokayukta
- Create specific performance and accountability measures for each job role; measure performance accordingly and make it matter

### Engagement with Private Sector
- Engage senior professionals from private sector to autonomously handle technical projects that have clear objectives, defined timelines and freedom to hire own teams; provide incentives such that such professionals can return to their former private sector organisations post the assignment (e.g. UIDAI)
- Actively encourage advisory roles for senior private sector professionals in city agencies; IT is an area where this could be effectively piloted
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy &amp; Institutional Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Study BESCOM model for lateral hiring supported by an independent institution to screen and select candidates in select departments/roles such as CFO, CTO, Environmental Engineer etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Amend Cadre and Recruitment Rules, reduce deputation of staff from state government; create Karnataka Municipal Admin Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Introduce policy to recruit young professionals as fellows or interns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Introduce Short Service Commission like program where talented citizens can serve in civic agencies for predefined tenures, to begin with in limited departments, role types</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Review and eliminate redundant roles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ensure there is matching of skills and competencies and job roles, eliminate mismatch and fungibility across roles without commensurate skills e.g. swap between traffic management and law and order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Put in place detailed job roles and responsibilities, including between elected representatives and administrative staff in the BBMP so there is full clarity on who is responsible for what activity or task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Fill vacancies; increase staff strength as appropriate, based on detailed studies of organisation chart, workflows and job roles, span of control, time and motion studies etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Enhance strength of IAS cadre in the BBMP, have an IAS officer heading each of the 8 zones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Freeze Group D recruitment pending detailed study of manpower requirements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Human Resources & Organisation

Workflows & Processes

- Put in place a workflow management system whereby ward level engineers can file online field inspection reports that get reviewed by superiors. This can be supplemented by a robust grievance redress and monitoring system. This ensures that day to day operations are documented, tracked and reviewed thus ensuring that a minimum number of tasks are regularly performed by ward level engineers, and more time is created for strategic management at senior levels.

- Seriously consider comprehensive business process re-engineering of workflows and processes especially focussed on delivery of civic services to citizens and grievance redressal; consider deploying specialised teams for the same including from private sector.
Transparency

Improving Transparency

- Hold monthly press conferences to publish data on progress achieved, and status of various projects
- Fully disclose all govt. files on Bangalore’s development, status of the same, rationale for the decision, debates and discussions underlying the decision, funding and budgets etc.
- Publish details of water and power consumption in units in public domain; make it an agenda of civic responsibility and pride
- Create a website which contains in an easily searchable format, names and contact details of all key government officials relevant to Bangalore
- Make phone numbers of councillors and contractors of each project/road easily accessible to the public
## Leveraging Information Technology

- **Undertake phased but comprehensive digitisation of manual records pertaining to citizens or city operations**
- Introduce newer technologies, IT solutions to monitor implementation by government. Create an institutional mechanism to oversee this process
- Deepen e-governance, pilot e-wards model
- Do not permit the digital connectivity agenda distract from provision of basic infrastructure and services
## Accountability

### Increasing Accountability

- Job security needs to be task and performance centred.
- Use TV to hold public debates and programs like Aap ki Adaalat to hold public officers accountable
- Appoint two citizen representatives who each MLA or Corporator will be answerable to
- **Plug pilferages and corruption/ misuse of funds and bring more transparency and accountability to the governing system**
- Adopt principles of corporate governance in city governance
- Push the agenda towards more market mechanisms - Including metrics and disclosures
- Change definition of success measures/basis of decision-making e.g. decisions on sell vs lease, privatise or not etc.